

**BEFORE THE TENNESSEE PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION
NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE**

IN RE:)	
)	DOCKET NO. 20-00024
PETITION FOR DECLARATORY ORDER)	
BY ENGIE DEVELOPMENT, LLC)	

PROTECTIVE ORDER

To expedite the flow of filings, exhibits, and other materials, and to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes as to the confidentiality of material, adequately protect material entitled to be kept confidential and to ensure that protection is afforded only to material so entitled, the Tennessee Public Utility Commission (“Commission” or “TPUC”) hereby orders that:

1. For the purpose of this Protective Order (“Order”), proprietary or confidential information, hereinafter referred to as “Confidential Information,” shall mean documents, testimony, or information in whatever form which the Producing Party, in good faith, and based on reasonable inquiry, deems to contain non-public financial information the disclosure of which would be competitively harmful to the Producing Party, trade secrets, confidential research or development information, confidential data of third parties or other sensitive information and which has been specifically designated by the Producing Party as confidential. A “Producing Party” is defined as the party creating the Confidential Information as well as the party having actual physical possession of the information produced pursuant to this Order. All summaries, notes, extracts, compilations, or other direct or indirect reproduction from or of any protected materials shall be entitled to protection under this Order. Documents containing Confidential Information shall be conspicuously and specifically labeled as “CONFIDENTIAL.” The documents must be produced in a way that will clearly identify to others that it contains

Confidential Information. Any document so designated shall be handled in accordance with the Order. The provisions of any document containing Confidential Information may be challenged under Paragraph 11 of this Order.

2. Any individual or company subject to this Order, including Producing Parties or persons reviewing Confidential Information, shall act in good faith in discharging their obligations hereunder. Parties or non-parties subject to this Order shall include ENGIE Development, LLC (the “Company”) and the Consumer Advocate Unity in the Financial Division of the Office of the Tennessee Attorney General (“Consumer Advocate”).

3. Subject to the exceptions noted below in this Paragraph 3, Confidential Information shall be disclosed only to the following persons:

- a. counsel of record for the Company and the Consumer Advocate and associates, secretaries, and paralegals actively engaged in assisting counsel in this docket and any appeals therefrom;
- b. in-house counsel for the Company and the Consumer Advocate;
- c. officers, directors, or employees of the Company and the Consumer Advocate; provided that such officers, directors, and/or employees shall be subject to the provisions of this Protective Order, and shall not disclose such information further except as otherwise permitted under the terms of this Protective Order;
- d. TPUC Commissioners and members of the staff of the Commission;
- e. outside consultants and expert witnesses employed or retained by the Company of the Consumer Advocate or their counsel, who have access to Confidential Information solely for evaluation, testing, testimony, preparation or trial or other services related to this docket, provided that to the extent that the Company or the Consumer Advocate seeks to disclose Confidential Information to any outside consultant or expert witness who is expected to testify on that party’s behalf, the Company of the Consumer Advocate shall give five (5) days written notice to the Producing Party of intention to disclose Confidential Information. During such notice period, the Producing Party may move to prevent or limit disclosure for cause, in which case no disclosure shall be made until the TPUC, the hearing officer, the administrative law judge, or court rules on the motion. Any such motion

shall be filed within three (3) days after service of the notice. Any response shall be filed within three (3) days after service of the notice. Pre-hearing conferences may be called to confer with the Company and the Consumer Advocate on the Motions to Limit Disclosure. All service shall be by hand delivery or by facsimile; and

- f. notwithstanding anything else to the contrary, under no circumstances shall any Confidential Information be disclosed to or discussed with anyone associated with the marketing of services in competition with the products, goods, or services of the Producing Party.

4. Prior to disclosure of the Confidential Information to any of the authorized persons under paragraph 3(a)-(d), the counsel representing the party who is to receive the Confidential Information shall provide a copy of the Order to the recipient Director, staff member, employee, or officer, who shall be bound by the terms of this Order. Prior to disclosure of Confidential Information to any outside consultant or expert witness employed or retained by a party under paragraph 3(e), counsel for the party seeking such disclosure shall provide a copy of this Order to such outside consultant or expert witness, who shall sign an affidavit in the form of that attached to this Order attesting that he or she has read a copy of this Order, that he or she understands and agrees to be bound by the terms of this Order, and that he or she understands that unauthorized disclosure of the documents labeled CONFIDENTIAL constitutes a violation of this Order (the "Affidavit"). The Affidavit shall be signed in the presence of and be notarized by a notary public. Counsel of record for each party shall provide the Producing Party a copy of each such Affidavit and shall keep the Affidavits executed by the parties' experts or consultants on file in their respective offices.

5. If the Company or the Consumer Advocate inadvertently fails to label documents as CONFIDENTIAL in accordance with the provisions of this Order when producing such documents, such failure shall not constitute a waiver of confidentiality, provided the Producing Party shall notify the recipient of the document in writing within five (5) days of discovery of such

inadvertent failure to label the document as CONFIDENTIAL. At that time, the recipients will immediately treat the subject document as Confidential Information. In no event shall the TPUC or Consumer Advocate be liable for any claims or damages resulting from the disclosure of a document while not so labeled as CONFIDENTIAL. An inadvertent failure to label a document as CONFIDENTIAL shall not, in any way, affect the TPUC's determination as to whether the document is entitled to Confidential Information status.

6. Any papers filed in this proceeding that contain, quote, paraphrase, compile, or otherwise disclose documents covered by the terms of this Order, or any information contained therein, shall be filed with the TPUC in sealed envelopes labeled CONFIDENTIAL. The filing party shall also include with the filing a public version of any papers with any Confidential Information redacted. In the TPUC's files, each sealed envelope shall be labeled to reflect the styled and docket number of this proceeding and to identify the subject matter of the content of the sealed envelope. Further, the envelopes at the TPUC shall be maintained in a locked filing cabinet. The envelopes shall not be opened or their contents reviewed by anyone except upon order by the TPUC, hearing officer, or administrative law judge after due notice to counsel of record. Notwithstanding the foregoing, the Commissioners and staff of the TPUC may review any paper filed as Confidential Information and labeled as CONFIDENTIAL without obtaining an order of the TPUC, hearing officer, or administrative law judge, provided the Commissioners and staff maintain the confidentiality of the paper in accordance with the terms of this Order.

7. The designation by the Company of any information, documents, or things in accordance with this Order as constituting or containing Confidential Information and the Consumer Advocate's treatment of such material as Confidential Information in compliance with this Order is not an admission or agreement by the Consumer Advocate that the material constitutes

or contains Confidential Information and shall not be deemed to be either a waiver of the right to challenge such designation or an acceptance of such designation. The Company agrees to designate such information, documents or things provided to the Consumer Advocate as Confidential Information if it has a good faith basis for the claim. The Company will, upon request of the Consumer Advocate, provide a written explanation of the details, including any statutory authority, that support its confidential commercial information or trade secret claim within five (5) days of a written request. The Company also specifically agrees that it will not designate any documents as Confidential Information or label such documents as CONFIDENTIAL if the documents.

- a. have been distributed to the public, consumers, or others, provided that proprietary customer information provided by the Company to its customers or their marketers may be designated as Confidential Information; or
- b. are not maintained by the Company as confidential commercial information or trade secrets or are not maintained by the Company as proprietary customer information.

8. Documents, information, and testimony designated as Confidential Information and labeled CONFIDENTIAL, in accordance with the Order, may be disclosed in testimony at the hearing on the merits of this proceeding and offered into evidence in any hearing related to this action, subject to the applicable rules of evidence and to such future orders as the TPUC, hearing officer, or administrative law judge may enter. Any party intending to use documents, information, or testimony designated as Confidential Information shall inform the Producing Party and the TPUC, hearing officer, or administrative law judge, prior to the hearing on the merits of the case, of the proposed use, and shall advise the TPUC, the hearing officer, or administrative law judge, and the Producing Party before use of such information during witness examinations so that appropriate measures can be taken by the TPUC, hearing officer, or administrative law judge to protect the confidential nature of the information.

9. Except for documents filed with the TPUC, all documents covered by the terms of the Order that are disclosed to the requesting party shall be maintained in filed labeled CONFIDENTIAL and labeled with reference to this Order and the offices of the requesting party's counsel of record.

10. Nothing herein shall be construed as preventing any party from continuing to use and disclose any information (a) that is in the public domain, or (b) that subsequently becomes part of the public domain through no act of, or violation of the terms herein, any party subject to this Order, or (c) that is disclosed to it by a third party, where said disclosure does not itself violate any contractual or legal obligation or terms of this Order, or (d) that is independently developed by a party, or (e) that is known or used by it prior to this proceeding. The burden of establishing the existence of (a) through (e) shall be upon the party attempting to use or disclose such information.

11. Any party may contest the designation of any document or information as Confidential Information by filing a motion with the TPUC, hearing officer, administrative law judge, or the courts, as appropriate, for a ruling that the documents, information, or testimony should not be so treated. All documents, information, and testimony designated as Confidential Information must be received not later than five (5) days prior to the hearing on the merits or as otherwise ordered by the TPUC. Motions made and subsequent replies received within the five (5) days prior to the Hearing on the merits shall be presented to the TPUC at the hearing on the merits for a ruling.

12. Non-party witnesses shall be entitled to invoke the provisions of this Order by designating information disclosed or documents produced for use in this action as Confidential Information pursuant to the terms of this Order.

13. No person authorized under the terms herein to receive access to documents, information, or testimony designated as Confidential Information shall be granted access until such person has complied with the requirements set forth in Paragraph 4 of this Order.

14. Any person to whom disclosure or inspection is made in violation of this Order shall be bound by the terms of this Order.

15. Upon an order becoming final in this proceeding and conclusion of any appeals resulting from such an order, all the filings, exhibits, and other materials designated Confidential Information and all copies thereof shall be returned to counsel of the party who produced the filings, exhibits, and other materials within fifteen (15) days of a written request from the Producing Party, or counsel in possession of such documents shall certify to counsel of the Producing Party that all filings, exhibits, and other materials designated as Confidential Information and all copies thereof have been destroyed. The Consumer Advocate may elect to retain the Confidential Information if it deems it appropriate in the discharge of its duties or in the public interest, but in doing so, the Consumer Advocate will continue to abide by the terms of this Order. The requirements of this paragraph shall become operative immediately upon any party (including any intervenor) who withdraws or otherwise ceases to be a party to the case, even though the case itself may continue to be pending. Subject to the requirements of Paragraph 7 above, the TPUC shall retain copies of information designated as confidential as may be necessary to maintain the record of this cause intact.

16. After termination of this proceeding, the provisions of this Order relating to the secrecy and confidential nature of confidential documents, information, and testimony shall continue to be binding, upon parties hereto and their officers, employers, employees, agents, and/or others for five (5) years unless this Order is vacated or modified or otherwise ordered by the TPUC.

17. Nothing herein shall prevent a party from seeking further protection for particular documents or prevent entry of a subsequent order, upon an appropriate showing, requiring that any documents, information, or testimony designated as Confidential Information shall receive protection other than that provided herein.

18. The Consumer Advocate and its staff have authority to enter into non-disclosure agreements pursuant to Tenn. Code Ann. § 65-4-118(d) which are consistent with state and federal law, regulations, and rules.

19. The Consumer Advocate and its staff agree to keep Confidential Information in a secure place and will not permit them to be seen by any person who is not an employee of the State of Tennessee, the Office of the Attorney General and Reporter, or a person who has signed a Non-disclosure Agreement.

20. The Consumer Advocate and its staff may make copies of Confidential Information and any portion thereof. To the extent not prohibited by state and federal law, regulations, and rules, all notes utilizing supporting information shall be subject to the terms of this Order to the extent factual assertions are derived from the supporting information.

21. To the extent not prohibited by law, the Consumer Advocate will provide timely notice of filing or disclosure in the discharge of the duties of the Office of the Attorney General and Reporter, pursuant to Tenn. Code Ann. § 10-7-504(a)(5)(C) or any other law, regulation, or rule, so that the Company may take action relating to disclosure.

22. Nothing in this Order shall prevent the Consumer Advocate from using the Confidential Information received for investigative purposes in the discharge of the duties of the Office of the Tennessee Attorney General and Reporter. Additionally, nothing in this Order shall prevent the Consumer Advocate from informing state officials and third parties of the fact of an

investigation, as needed, to conduct the investigation. Without limiting the scope of this paragraph, nothing in this Order shall prevent the Consumer Advocate from contacting consumers whose names were provided by the Company or from discussing with any consumer any materials that he or she allegedly received from the Company or confirming that a consumer actually received the materials, to the extent that the Consumer Advocate does so in a manner that complies with the provisions of this Order.

23. Confidential Information is subject to this Protective Order, which is entered pursuant to Rule 26 of the Tennessee Rules of Civil Procedure. If any person or entity subject to this Protective Order, other than the Producing Party, receives a request or subpoena seeking the disclosure or production of “Confidential Information,” such person or entity shall give prompt written notice to the TPUC Hearing Officer and the Producing Party within not more than five (5) days of receiving such request, subpoena, or order and: (i) shall respond to the request, subpoena, or order, in writing, stating that the Confidential Information is protected pursuant to this Protective Order, and (ii) shall not disclose or produce such Confidential Information unless and until subsequently ordered to do so by a court of competent jurisdiction. This Protective Order shall operate as an exception to the Tennessee Public Record Act, as set forth in the language of Tenn. Code Ann. § 10-7-504(a)(5)(A)(i).

24. Nothing in this Order is intended to restrict or alter federal or state laws, regulations, or rules.

25. Any person who has signed a non-disclosure certificate or is otherwise bound by the terms of this Order shall continue to be bound by this Order and/or certificate even if no longer engaged by the TPUC or Intervenors.

26. Any party aggrieved with the TPUC's decision in this matter may file a Petition for Reconsideration with the TPUC within fifteen (15) days from and after the date of this Order.

27. Any party aggrieved with the TPUC's decision in this matter has the right of judicial review by filing a Petition for Review in the Tennessee Court of Appeals, Middle Section, within sixty (60) days from and after the date of this Order.

This the 3rd day of April, 2020.



Aaron J. Conklin, Hearing Officer

**BEFORE THE TENNESSEE PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION
NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE**

IN RE:)	
)	DOCKET NO. 20-00024
PETITION FOR DECLARATORY ORDER)	
BY ENGIE DEVELOPMENT, LLC)	

AGREEMENT TO COMPLY WITH PROTECTIVE ORDER

I have reviewed the Protective Order entered in the above-captioned matter and agree to Abide and be bound by its terms. I understand that unauthorized disclosure of documents labeled "CONFIDENTIAL" will be a violation of the Order.

DATE

NAME

STATE OF _____)

COUNTY OF _____)

Personally appeared before me, _____, a Notary Public, _____ with whom I am personally acquainted, who acknowledge that he executed the within instrument for the purposes therein contained.

WITNESS my hand, at office, this _____ day of _____, _____.

NOTARY PUBLIC

My Commission Expires: _____