

**BEFORE THE TENNESSEE PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION
NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE**

August 25, 2017

IN RE:)	
)	
ATMOS ENERGY CORPORATION'S EAST)	
TENNESSEE AND UNION CITY TENNESSEE)	DOCKET NO. 16-00109
2015-2016 ACA FILING)	
)	

**ORDER APPROVING COMPLIANCE AUDIT REPORT OF
TENNESSEE PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION'S UTILITIES DIVISION**

This matter came before Chairman David F. Jones, Vice Chairman Robin L. Morrison and Commissioner Kenneth C. Hill of the of the Tennessee Public Utility Commission ("TPUC" or "Commission"), the voting panel assigned to this docket, at a regularly scheduled Commission Conference held on July 10, 2017. The panel considered the Commission's Utilities Division (the "Staff" or "Audit Staff") Actual Cost Adjustment ("ACA") Compliance Audit Report (the "Audit Report") attached hereto as Exhibit 1, and incorporated herein by reference, resulting from the Staff's audit of Atmos Energy Corporation's ("Atmos" or "Company") annual deferred gas cost account filing for the period July 1, 2015 through June 30, 2016.

On September 13, 2016, Atmos submitted its annual report of the transactions in its ACA Accounts for Union City, Tennessee and its ACA Account for all other Tennessee towns for the period of July 1, 2015 through June 30, 2016.¹

¹ Atmos' filing consists of two separate calculations. One covers the customers located in Union City (UC) Tennessee. The other covers all the other towns in Tennessee served by the Company (ETN). The Company requested separate PGA rates due to the fact that Union City gets its gas from a different pipeline source than the rest of the state.

On June 21, 2017, the Company and Staff mutually agreed to extend the Commission's 180 day notification deadline found in TPUC Rule 1220-4-7-.03(2) to July 31, 2017.² The Staff filed its ACA Report with the Commission on June 28, 2017.

The Report found that despite two immaterial findings, the Purchased Gas Adjustment mechanism as calculated in the ACA appear to be working properly and in accordance with the TPUC rules for Atmos Energy Corporation.³ The Report contained two immaterial audit findings:

1. The Company erroneously booked an \$11,432.95 Columbia Gulf invoice as a Commodity Cost rather than a Demand Cost. Audit Staff reclassified this invoice as a Demand Cost.⁴ The reclassification did not change the net balance in the ACA Account; therefore, this is not a monetary finding; and

2. The Company used incorrect interest rates when calculating interest on monthly balances for the months of April through June 2016, leading to an understatement of the amount of interest owed to customers for these months. Audit Staff corrected the rates, which increased the interest due to customers by \$1,074.49 for the "All Other Towns" filing.⁵

Based on these findings, the over-collected ending balance in the combined ACA Accounts at June 30, 2016 was under-stated by \$1,074.49. Therefore, the corrected combined ACA Accounts balance at June 30, 2016 as stated in the Report is a negative \$1,071,312.70, the cumulative amount of over-collected gas costs at the end of the review period. Of this amount \$82,658.75 in under-collection result from the Union City filing and \$1,153,971.45 in over-

² *Memorandum*, p. 2 (June 21, 2017).

³ *ACA Report*, Exhibit A to *Notice of Filing by the Utilities Division of the Tennessee Public Utility Commission*, p.1 (June 28, 2017).

⁴ *Id.* at 6.

⁵ *Id.* at 7.

collections are the result of the other Tennessee towns filing. Additionally, the Report found that the dollar amount of the finding is not material when compared with the total amount of gas costs.⁶ The Company agreed with these findings and will make the appropriate corrections for the 2016-2017 ACA period.⁷

At a regularly scheduled Commission Conference held on July 10, 2017, the panel considered the Audit Report and found that the Audit objective was met, and except for two immaterial findings, the ending balances in the ACA Accounts for the period ended June 30, 2016 were accurately calculated and in compliance with Atmos' tariff. Thereafter, the panel voted unanimously to approve the June 18, 2017 Staff Audit Report as filed, including the Audit Staff's adjusted ACA Account Balance of \$82,658.75 in under-recovered gas costs for the Union City filing and an ACA Account Balance of \$1,153,971.45 in over-recovered gas costs for the East Tennessee filing.

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED THAT:

The Actual Cost Adjustment Compliance Audit Report of Atmos Energy Corporation's East Tennessee and Union City Tennessee annual deferred gas cost account filing for the year ended June 30, 2016, a copy of which is attached to this Order as Exhibit 1, is approved and adopted, and is incorporated in this Order as though fully rewritten herein.

Chairman David F. Jones, Vice Chairman Robin L. Morrison and Commissioner Kenneth C. Hill concur.

ATTEST:



Earl R. Taylor, Executive Director

⁶ *ACA Report, Exhibit A to Notice of Filing by the Utilities Division of the Tennessee Public Utility Commission*, p.1 (June 28, 2017).

⁷ *Id.* at 6.

EXHIBIT 1

BEFORE THE TENNESSEE PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE

June 28, 2017

IN RE:)
)
ATMOS ENERGY CORPORATION) **Docket No. 16-00109**
ACTUAL COST ADJUSTMENT ("ACA") AUDIT)

**NOTICE OF FILING BY THE UTILITIES DIVISION OF THE TENNESSEE
PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**


Pursuant to Tenn. Code Ann. §§65-4-104, 65-4-111 and 65-3-108, the Utilities Division of the Tennessee Public Utility Commission ("TPUC" or the "Commission") hereby gives notice of its filing of the Compliance Audit Report of the Actual Cost Adjustment Audit (hereafter "ACA") component of the Purchased Gas Adjustment Rule for Atmos Energy Corporation (the "Company") in this docket and would respectfully state as follows:

1. The present docket was opened by the Commission to hear matters arising out of the audit of the Company's ACA filing for the period July 1, 2015 through June 30, 2016.
2. The Company's ACA filing was received on September 13, 2016, and the Staff completed its audit of same on June 21, 2017. The original 180-day deadline for the Staff's completion of the audit was extended to July 31, 2017 by mutual consent of Atmos Energy Corporation and the TPUC Audit Staff as provided for in the Purchased Gas Adjustment Rule 1220-4-7-.03(2).

3. On June 22, 2017, the Utilities Division submitted its preliminary ACA audit findings to the Company via e-mail. The Company responded on June 27, 2017 via e-mail and this response has been incorporated into the final report. The Report is attached hereto as Exhibit A and is fully incorporated herein by this reference.

4. The Utilities Division hereby files its Report with the Tennessee Public Utility Commission for deposit as a public record and approval of the Report and the recommendations contained therein.

Respectfully Submitted:


Michelle Ramsey, Audit Manager
Utilities Division of the
Tennessee Public Utility Commission

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this 28th day of June, 2017, a true and exact copy of the foregoing has been either hand-delivered or delivered via U.S. Mail, postage pre-paid, to the following persons:

David F. Jones
Chairman
Tennessee Public Utility Commission
502 Deaderick Street 4th Floor
Nashville, TN 37243

Mr. Mark A. Martin
Vice President of Rates and Regulatory Affairs
Atmos Energy Corporation
3275 Highland Point Dr.
Owensboro, KY 42303-7835

Mr. Stellie S. Jackson
Rate Administration Analyst
Atmos Energy Corporation
P.O. Box 650205
Dallas, TX 75265-0205

A. Scott Ross, Esq.
Neal & Harwell, PLC
1201 Demonbreun Street
Suite 1000
Nashville, TN 37203

Mr. Wayne M. Irvin
Office of the Attorney General
Consumer Advocate and Protection Division
P. O. Box 20207
Nashville, TN 37202


Michelle Ramsey

COMPLIANCE AUDIT
ATMOS ENERGY CORPORATION
ACTUAL COST ADJUSTMENT
DOCKET NO. 16-00109
TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>PAGE NO.</u>
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. AUDIT OPINION	1
III. SUMMARY OF COMPANY FILING	1
IV. DESCRIPTION OF THE PURCHASED GAS ADJUSTMENT RULE	2
V. SCOPE OF ACTUAL COST ADJUSTMENT AUDIT	3
VI. BACKGROUND INFORMATION ON COMPANY AND GAS SUPPLIERS	3
VII. JURISDICTION OF THE TENNESSEE REGULATORY AUTHORITY	4
VIII. ACA FINDINGS	5
IX. STAFF CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	8
APPENDIX A – PGA FORMULA	9

COMPLIANCE AUDIT REPORT
OF
ATMOS ENERGY CORPORATION
ACTUAL COST ADJUSTMENT
DOCKET NO. 16-00109

PREPARED BY
TENNESSEE PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION
UTILITIES DIVISION
June 2017

EXHIBIT A

I. INTRODUCTION

The subject of this audit is Atmos Energy Corporation's ("Company" or "Atmos") compliance with the Actual Cost Adjustment and Refund Adjustment of the Purchased Gas Adjustment Rule ("PGA Rule") of the Tennessee Public Utility Commission ("TPUC" or the "Commission")¹. The objective of the audit is to determine whether the Purchased Gas Adjustments, which are encompassed by the Actual Cost Adjustment ("ACA") as more fully described in Section IV, for the year ended June 30, 2016 are calculated correctly and are supported by appropriate source documentation.

II. AUDIT OPINION

The Audit Staff ("Staff") concludes that, except for the finding noted in Section VIII, the Purchased Gas Adjustment mechanism as calculated in the Actual Cost Adjustment appears to be working properly and in accordance with the TPUC rules for Atmos Energy Corporation. The amount of the findings contained herein is not material with respect to the total gas costs.

III. SUMMARY OF COMPANY FILING

The Company filed its annual report of the transactions in the Deferred Gas Costs Account ("ACA Account") for its Tennessee service areas on September 13, 2016. This ACA filing showed \$46,989,871.66 in total gas costs, with \$41,256,706.58 being recovered from customers through rates. Adding a beginning balance in the ACA account of \$6,719,134.04 in net over-recovered gas costs from the preceding ACA period and interest due to customers for the current period of \$84,269.25 resulted in an ACA Account balance at June 30, 2016 of \$1,070,238.21 in over-recovered gas costs.²

ATMOS ENERGY CORPORATION SUMMARY OF ACA FILING FOR PERIOD JULY 2015-JUNE 2016

Line		Union City	Other TN Towns	Total
1	Beginning Balance (July 2015)	(\$242,636.29)	(\$6,476,497.75)	(\$6,719,134.04)
2	Purchased Gas Costs	1,201,626.66	45,788,245.00	46,989,871.66
3	Gas Costs recovered through rates	873,191.93	40,383,514.65	41,256,706.58
4	Interest on monthly balances	<u>(3,139.69)</u>	<u>(81,129.56)</u>	<u>(84,269.25)</u>
5	Ending Balance (June 2016) (Line 1 + Line 2 - Line 3 + Line 4)	<u>\$ 82,658.75</u>	<u>(\$1,152,896.96)</u>	<u>(\$1,070,238.21)</u>

¹ As of April 5, 2017, the name of Tennessee Regulatory Authority has changed to the Tennessee Public Utility Commission and board members of the agency will be known as Commissioners rather than Directors.

² The filing was comprised individually of a \$82,658.75 under-recovered balance in the Union City service area and a \$1,152,896.96 over-recovered balance in the remaining Tennessee towns service area.

****A number in () is a negative or credit balance which represents an over-collection of gas costs.**

The Company began a refund to its Union City customers and customers in other Tennessee service areas on October 1, 2016, to distribute the balances in the ACA accounts as of June 30, 2016.³ Staff's finding resulting from this audit is described in detail in Section VIII of this report.

IV. DESCRIPTION OF PURCHASED GAS ADJUSTMENT RULE

Actual Cost Adjustment Audits:

The PGA Rule can be found in Chapter 1220-4-7 of the Rules of the Tennessee Regulatory Authority, now the Tennessee Public Utility Commission. The PGA Rule permits a gas company to recover, in a timely manner, the total cost of gas purchased for delivery to its customers and to assure that a company does not over-collect or under-collect gas costs from its customers. The PGA Rule consists of three major components:

- 1. The Actual Cost Adjustment (ACA)**
- 2. The Gas Charge Adjustment (GCA)**
- 3. The Refund Adjustment (RA)**

The ACA is the difference between the revenues billed customers by means of the GCA and the cost of gas invoiced the Company by suppliers plus margin loss (if allowed by order of the TPUC in another docket) as reflected in the Deferred Gas Cost account. The ACA then "true-up" the difference between the actual gas costs and the gas costs recovered from customers through a surcharge or a refund. The RA refunds the "true-up" along with other supplier refunds. For a more complete definition of the GCA and RA, please see the PGA Formula in Appendix A.

Section 1220-4-7-.03(2) of the PGA Rule requires:

"Each year, the Company shall file with the [Authority] an annual report reflecting the transactions in the Deferred Gas Cost Account. Unless the [Authority] provides written notification to the Company within one hundred eighty (180) days from the date of filing the report, the Deferred Gas Cost Adjustment Account shall be deemed in compliance with the provisions of these Rules. This 180 day notification period may be extended by mutual consent of the Company and the [Authority] Staff or by order of the [Authority]."

³ Tariff Filing No. 2016-0125 for ETN and 2016-0124 for Union City.

Prudence Audit of Gas Purchases:

Section 1220-4-7-.05 of the PGA Rule requires, unless otherwise ordered by the Commission, an "Audit of Prudence of Gas Purchases" by a qualified consultant. This specialized audit evaluates and reports annually on the prudence of any gas costs included in the PGA. In Docket 97-01364, Atmos Energy was authorized to operate under a Performance-Based Ratemaking Mechanism ("PBR"), beginning April 1, 1999, and continuing each year unless terminated by the Company or the Authority. For each year that the mechanism is in effect, the requirements of Section 1220-4-7-.05 of the PGA Rule is waived.

V. SCOPE OF ACTUAL COST ADJUSTMENT AUDIT

The ACA audit is a limited compliance audit of the Company's ACA Account. The audit goal is to verify that the Company's calculations of gas costs incurred and recovered were materially correct,⁴ and that the Company is following all Commission orders and directives with respect to its calculation of the ACA Account balance. Also included in this audit is the Company's PGA filing implementing a net refund of the ACA Account balance, effective October 1, 2016. Refer to the ACA Account detail provided in Section III, Summary of Company Filing.

To accomplish the audit goal, Audit Staff reviewed gas supply invoices, as well as supplemental schedules and other source documentation provided by Atmos. Where appropriate, Staff requested additional information to clarify the filing.

VI. BACKGROUND INFORMATION ON COMPANY AND GAS SUPPLIERS

Atmos Energy Corporation, with its corporate headquarters located in Dallas, Texas, has its local offices in Franklin, Tennessee. On October 4, 2002, the Company filed tariffs to officially change its name from United Cities Gas Company to Atmos Energy Corporation. Atmos is a multi-state gas distributor, providing service to customers in twelve cities and surrounding areas in Tennessee. The natural gas used to serve these areas is purchased from four natural gas pipelines in accordance with separate and individual tariffs approved by the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission (FERC). The interstate pipelines are Tennessee Gas Pipeline (TGP), East Tennessee Natural Gas (ETNG), Texas Gas Transmission Corporation (TGTC), and Texas Eastern Transmission Corporation (TETC).

TGP and ETNG provide service to east Tennessee towns, which include Columbia, Shelbyville, Maryville, Morristown, Elizabethton, Greeneville, Johnson City, Kingsport, Bristol and adjacent areas in Maury, Bedford, Moore, Blount, Hamblen, Sullivan, Carter, Washington, and Greene Counties.

⁴ The audit goal is not to guarantee that the Company's results are 100% correct. Where it is appropriate, Staff utilizes sampling techniques to determine whether the Company's calculations are materially correct. Material discrepancies would dictate a broadening of the scope of Staff's review.

TETC provides service to Atmos in Murfreesboro and Franklin and adjacent areas in Rutherford and Williamson Counties. TGTC provides service to Atmos in Union City and adjacent areas in Obion County.

Atmos' gas Commodity requirements were met under a contract between Atmos and its affiliate Atmos Energy Marketing (AEM) approved by the Authority in Docket No. 15-00009 and in Docket No. 16-00008. Asset Management fees are shared with ratepayers according to the terms of the contract as a credit to the ACA Account.

VII. JURISDICTION OF THE TENNESSEE REGULATORY AUTHORITY

Tennessee Code Annotated (T.C.A.) gave jurisdiction and control over public utilities to the Tennessee Regulatory Authority. T.C.A. §65-4-104 states that:

The [A]uthority has general supervisory and regulatory power, jurisdiction, and control over all public utilities, and also over their property, property rights, facilities, and franchises, so far as may be necessary for the purpose of carrying out the provisions of this chapter.

Further, T.C.A. §65-4-105 grants the same power to the Authority with reference to all public utilities within its jurisdiction as chapters 3 and 5 of Title 65 of the T.C.A. have conferred on the Department of Transportation's oversight of the railroads or the Department of Safety's oversight of transportation companies. By virtue of T.C.A. §65-3-108, this power includes the right to audit:

The department is given full power to examine the books and papers of the companies, and to examine, under oath, the officers, agents, and employees of the companies and any other persons, to procure the necessary information to intelligently and justly discharge its duties and carry out the provisions of this chapter and chapter 5 of this title.

The TPUC's Utilities Division is responsible for auditing those gas, electric, and water companies under its jurisdiction, to ensure that each company is abiding by Tennessee statute as well as the Rules and Regulations of the Commission. Michelle Ramsey of the Utilities Division conducted this audit.

VIII. ACA FINDINGS

Staff's audit findings totaled a **net over-recovery of \$1,074.49**. This amount results from the net total of two (2) finding and represents an increase to the Company's reported over-recovered amount of \$1,070,238.21. The finding, added to the Company's calculated balance, results in a net ending balance in the ACA account of **\$1,071,312.70 in over-recovered gas costs.**⁵ A summary of the ACA account as filed by the Company and as adjusted by the Staff is shown below, followed by a description of the findings.

SUMMARY OF THE ACA ACCOUNT**:

Line		Atmos Combined Filing	Staff Audit Results	Difference (Findings)
1	Adj. Beginning Balance (July 2015)	(\$6,719,134.04)	(\$6,719,134.04)	\$0.00
2	Purchased Gas Costs	46,989,871.66	46,989,871.66	0.00
3	Gas Costs recovered through rates	41,256,706.58	41,256,706.58	0.00
4	Interest on monthly balances	<u>(84,269.25)</u>	<u>(85,343.74)</u>	<u>(1,074.49)</u>
5	Ending Balance (June 2016) (Line 1 + Line 2 – Line 3 + Line 4)	<u>(\$1,070,238.21)</u>	<u>(\$1,071,312.70)</u>	<u>(\$1,074.49)</u>

**A number in () is a negative or credit balance which represents an over-collection of gas costs.

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS:

			<u>See page</u>
FINDING #1	ETN-Gas Costs Misclassification	No \$\$ effect	6
FINDING #4	Interest	<u>(\$ 1,074.49)</u> Over-recovery	7

Net Result	<u>(\$1,074.49)</u>	Over-recovery
-------------------	----------------------------	----------------------

⁵ The ending balance is made up of \$82,658.75 under-recovery for the Union City filing and \$1,153,971.45 over-recovery for the ETN filing.

FINDING #1:**Exception**

The Company erroneously booked a Purchase Gas Cost as a Commodity Cost rather than as a Demand Cost.

Discussion

In April 2016, the Company erroneously booked \$11,432.95 from Columbia Gulf invoice as a Commodity cost rather than a Demand cost. Therefore, Staff reclassified the \$11,432.95 Columbia Gulf invoice from Commodity cost to Demand cost. Staff's adjustment has no effect on the reported gas cost in the total net ACA filing (excluding interest).

Company Response

The Company agrees with Staff's findings and we will make the appropriate corrections for the 2016 – 2017 ACA period.

FINDING #2:

Exception

The Company understated the amount of interest due to customers in its ACA filing.

Discussion

The Company used incorrect interest rates for April through June of 2016. Staff recalculated interest based on a correction of the interest rates for April through June of 2016 and the above finding. Therefore, interest due to customers is increased by \$1,074.49 for the **“All Other Towns” filing**.

Company Response

The Company agrees with Staff's findings and we will make the appropriate corrections for the 2016 – 2017 ACA period.

IX. STAFF CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Staff reviewed the gas costs and recoveries of Atmos Energy Corporation for the 12-month period ended June 30, 2016. As reported in the body of this report, Staff concludes that the Purchased Gas Adjustment mechanism, as calculated in the Actual Cost Adjustment, appears to be working properly and in accordance with the TPUC rules for Atmos. Staff's audit procedures revealed two finding reported in Section VIII, with which the Company concurs. Based on the Company's filing and the audit adjustments by Staff, the **net balance** in the ACA Account as of June 30, 2016 was **negative \$1,071,312.70**. This means that as of June 30, 2016 the Company had over-collected this amount from its customers. The net balance is composed of a **total under-collection from Union City customers of \$82,658.75 and a total over-collection from customers in Other Tennessee towns of \$1,153,971.45**. Staff recommends approval of the Company's adjusted ACA Account balances.

APPENDIX A

PGA FORMULA

The computation of the GCA can be broken down into the following formulas:

$$\text{Firm GCA} = \frac{D + \text{DACA}}{\text{SF}} - \text{DB} + \frac{P + T + \text{SR} + \text{CACA}}{\text{ST}} - \text{CB}$$

$$\text{Non-Firm GCA} = \frac{P + T + \text{SR} + \text{CACA}}{\text{ST}} - \text{CB}$$

where

GCA = The Gas Charge Adjustment in dollars per Ccf/Therm, rounded to no more than five decimal places.

D = The sum of all fixed Gas Costs.

DACA = The demand portion of the ACA.

P = The sum of all commodity/gas charges.

T = The sum of all transportation charges.

SR = The sum of all FERC approved surcharges.

CACA = The commodity portion of the ACA.

DB = The per unit rate of demand costs or other fixed charges included in base rates in the most recently completed general rate case (which may be zero if the Company so elects and the Commission so approves).

CB = The per unit rate of variable gas costs included in base rates in the most recently completed general rate case (which may be zero if the Company so elects and the Commission so approves).

SF = Firm Sales.

ST = Total Sales.

The computation of the RA can be computed using the following formulas:

$$\text{Firm RA} = \frac{\text{DR1} - \text{DR2}}{\text{SFR}} + \frac{\text{CR1} - \text{CR2} + \text{CR3} + i}{\text{STR}}$$

$$\text{Non-Firm RA} = \frac{\text{CR1} - \text{CR2} + \text{CR3} + i}{\text{STR}}$$

where

- RA = The Refund Adjustment in dollars per Ccf/Therm, rounded to no more than five decimal places.
- DR1 = Demand refund not included in a currently effective Refund Adjustment, and received from suppliers by check, wire transfer, or credit memo.
- DR2 = A demand surcharge from a supplier not includable in the GCA, and not included in a currently effective Refund Adjustment.
- CR1 = Commodity refund not included in a currently effective Refund Adjustment, and received from suppliers by check, wire transfer, or credit memo.
- CR2 = A commodity surcharge from a supplier not includable in the GCA, and not included in a currently effective Refund Adjustment.
- CR3 = The residual balance of an expired Refund Adjustment.
- i = Interest on the "Refund Due Customers" account, using the average monthly balances based on the beginning and ending monthly balances. The interest rates for each calendar quarter used to compute such interest shall be the arithmetic mean (to the nearest one-hundredth of one percent) of the prime rate value published in the "Federal Reserve Bulletin" or in the Federal Reserve's "Selected Interest Rates" for the 4th, 3rd, and 2nd months preceding the 1st month of the calendar quarter.