## filed electronically in docket office on11/03/15



A Registered Limited Liability Partnership
Attorneys At Law
Established 1916
www.hsdlaw.com

WRITER'S DIRECT DIAL NUMBER: (423) 378-8858

WRITER'S E-MAIL ADDRESS: bovender@hsdlaw.com

KPOW.91564

S. Morris Hadden William C. Bovender William C. Argabrite Jimmie Carpenter Miller Mark S. Dessauer Gregory K. Haden Michael L. Forrester Stephen M. Darden Edward J. Webb, Jr. James N.L. Humphreys Suzanne Sweet Cook Michael S. Lattier Scott T. Powers Leslie Tentler Ridings Christopher D. Owens Chad W. Whitfield Jason A. Creech Meredith Bates Humbert Joseph B. Harvey Rachel Ralston Mancl Caroline Ross Williams

## Counsel

Teresa Mahan Lesnak Michael A. Eastridge Thomas R. Wilson Jeannette Smith Tysinger Kingsport, Tennessee 1212 North Eastman Road P.O. Box 3740 Kingsport, TN 37664-0740 Phone (423) 378-8800 Fax (423) 378-8801

Johnson City, Tennessee 100 Med Tech Parkway Suite 110 Johnson City, TN 37604 Phone (423) 283-6300 Fax (423) 283-6301

PLEASE RESPOND TO: KINGSPORT OFFICE

November 3, 2015

VIA EMAIL & FEDEX

Sharla Dillon, Dockets & Records Manager Tennessee Regulatory Authority 502 Deaderick Street, 4th Floor Nashville, TN 37243

Re:

Petition of Kingsport Power Company d/b/a AEP Appalachian

Power General Rate Case; Docket No.: 15-00093

## Dear Sharla:

Please find enclosed Kingsport Power Company d/b/a AEP Appalachian Power's Objection to Petitions of Intervenors for filing in the captioned docket. The original and four (4) copies are being shipped via FedEx for overnight delivery.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact the writer.

Very sincerely yours,

HUNTER, SMITH & DAVIS, LLP

William C. Bovender

Enclosure

Sharla Dillon, Dockets & Records Manager Page 2 November 3, 2015

c: Kelly Grams, Hearing Officer (via email)
Wayne M. Irvin, Esq. (via email)
Henry Walker, Esq. (via email)
Michael J. Quinan, Esq. (via email)
Charles B. Welch, Jr., Esq. (via email)
David Foster (via email)
James R. Bacha, Esq. (via email)
William Castle (via email)
Larry Foust (via email)
Brian West (via email)
John Shepelwich (via email)

BEFORE THE TENNESSEE REGULATORY AUTHORITY

NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE

IN RE:

PETITION OF KINGSPORT POWER COMPANY d/b/a AEP APPALACHIAN POWER GENERAL

RATE CASE

DOCKET NO.: 15-00093

**OBJECTION TO PETITIONS TO INTERVENE** 

Comes Petitioner, Kingsport Power Company d/b/a AEP Appalachian Power

("Kingsport"), and, objects to the Petitions to Intervene of The Energy Freedom Coalition of

America ("Coalition") and Sunrun, Inc., ("Sunrun"). As grounds for these objections, Kingsport

asserts the following:

1. Neither Coalition nor Sunrun are authorized to do business in Tennessee.

2. Neither Coalition nor Sunrun are actually doing business in Tennessee.

3. Neither Coalition nor Sunrun have any customers actually doing business in

Tennessee.

4. Neither Coalition nor Sunrun have any offices in or any connection with the

Kingsport service area.

If Kingsport were attempting to sue Coalition and/or Sunrun in the Courts of Tennessee,

it would be unsuccessful because neither has sufficient contacts with the State of Tennessee so as

to confer personal jurisdiction over them by the Tennessee Courts. State v. NV Sumatra Tobacco

Trading Co., 403 S.W.3d 726 (Tenn. 2013).

Similarly, the lack of contacts with the State of Tennessee means that Coalition and Sunrun lack constitutional standing to pursue their "claims" in the Tennessee Regulatory Authority. See, *City of Memphis v. Hargett*, 414 S.W.3d 88, 98-99 (Tenn. 2013). Indeed neither potential intervenor can show it will suffer "distinct and palpable" injuries. Their alleged potential injuries are "conjectural, hypothetical, or predicated upon an interest..." they share with other solar companies. *Id.* Coalition and Sunrun lack standing to pursue their hypothetical claims. *Id.* 

Allowing Coalition or Sunrun standing in this case would significantly and inappropriately broaden the scope of intervention to, by extension, allow any manufacturer of electricity consuming or producing devices to have standing comparable to actual customers of Kingsport. Coalition and Sunrun should have no different standing than a manufacturer of any electricity consuming device (e.g. a toaster or a clothes dryer) that may (or may not) sell such a product to customers in the Kingsport service territory sometime in the future.

Premises considered, the Petitions to Intervene of Coalition and Sunrun should be denied.

IN THE ALTERNATIVE, if the Petitions to Intervene are granted, the intervention and participation in this base rate case by Coalition and Sunrun should be strictly limited to issues concerning the proposed net metering tariff.

Coalition has filed an Amendment which seeks the opportunity not only to delve into the net metering tariff issue, but, also to participate as a full party to the proceeding by challenging "...any cost of service or rate design proposals from Kingsport Power that seek to distinguish between customer generators (i.e., customers with distributed energy resources) and nongenerating customers." (Amendment, pp. 1, 2).

Limited intervention for purposes of opposing the net metering tariff should be sufficient.

The open-ended nature of the Amendment claim would provide Coalition with the opportunity to

engage in costly and duplicative discovery. The Amendment which seeks to expand Coalition's

participation, when it lacks standing, should be denied.

Neither Coalition nor Sunrun should be permitted to participate generally in the Docket

and they, also, should not be permitted to participate in discovery of Kingsport or other parties

relative to all other issues in the base rate case.

Moreover, Coalition and Sunrun should not be permitted to receive confidential

discovery responses or confidential responses to staff data requests from Kingsport which do not

relate to the net metering tariff.

PREMISES CONSIDERED, Kingsport Power Company d/b/a AEP Appalachian Power

requests the actions prayed for herein.

Respectfully submitted,

KINGSPORT POWER COMPANY d/b/a AEP

APPALACHIAN POWER

William C. Bovender, Esq. (BPR #000751)

**HUNTER, SMITH & DAVIS, LLP** 

1212 N. Eastman Road

P. O. Box 3740

Kingsport, TN 37664

(423) 378-8858; Fax: (423) 378-8801

Email: bovender@hsdlaw.com

3

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a true and exact copy of the foregoing **OBJECTION TO PETITIONS TO INTERVENE** has been served upon the following by emailing a true and accurate copy on this the 3<sup>rd</sup> day of November, 2015:

Wayne M. Irvin (BPR #30946)
Assistant Attorney General
Consumer Advocate and Protection Division
Office of the Tennessee Attorney General
P.O. Box 20207
Nashville, TN 37202-0207
E-mail: wayne.irvin@ag.tn.gov

Henry Walker, Esq. (BPR #000272)
Bradley Arant Boult Cummings, LLP
1600 Division St., Ste 700
Nashville, TN 37203
Email: <a href="mailto:hwalker@babc.com">hwalker@babc.com</a>
Counsel for Sunrun, Inc.

Michael J. Quinan, Esq. (BPR #11104) Christian & Barton, LLP 909 East Main St., Ste 1200 Richmond, VA 23219 Email: <a href="mailto:mquinan@cblaw.com">mquinan@cblaw.com</a> Counsel for East Tennessee Energy Consumers

Charles B. Welch, Jr., Esq. (BPR #5593)
Farris Bobango, PLC
Bank of America Plaza
414 Union St., Ste 1105
Nashville, TN 37219
Email: cwelch@farris-law.com

Counsel for Energy Freedom Coalition of America, LLC

HUNTER, SMITH & DAVIS, LLP

William C. Bovender