ATTORNEYS AT LAW

333 UNION STREET SUITE 300 NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE 37201

TELEPHONE (615) 254-9146 TELECOPIER (615) 254-7123 www.LunaLawNashville.com

Jennifer L. Brundige jbrundige@LunaLawNashville.com

March 12, 2012

VIA EMAIL AND HAND DELIVERY filed electronically in docket office on 03/12/12

Kelly Cashman Grams, Esq. Hearing Officer Tennessee Regulatory Authority 460 James Robertson Parkway Nashville, Tennessee 37243-00505

Re: Docket No. 11-00210

Dear Hearing Officer Cashman Grams:

The parties in the above referenced docket are submitting the enclosed proposed agreed protective order for your consideration. To facilitate the efficient resolution of this matter, the parties have reached an agreement to use the agreed protective order that was entered in Chattanooga Gas Company's last rate case (Docket 09-00183) solely for purposes of this docket and do not waive any arguments in future dockets.

Sincerely,

Jennifer Brundige/cb

Enclosure

cc:

Counsel of Record

BEFORE THE TENNESSEE REGULATORY AUTHORITY NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE

March /2, 2012

IN RE:	
)	
COMPLAINT OF CONOCOPHILLIPS COMPANY)	
FOR AN ORDER DETERMINING	Docket No. 11-00210
CONOCOPHILLIPS NOT LIABLE FOR PENALTIES)	
AND CHARGES ASSESSED BY CHATTANOOGA)	
GAS COMPANY, OR, IN THE ALTERNATIVE,	
PETITION FOR SPECIAL RELIEF)	
,	

PROPOSED AGREED PROTECTIVE ORDER

To expedite the flow of filings, discovery, exhibits and other materials, and to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes regarding confidentiality of the material, adequately protect material entitled to be kept confidential and to ensure that protection is afforded only to material so entitled, and the parties being in agreement as to the entry of this Protective Order, the Hearing Officer, as appointed by the Tennessee Regulatory Authority ("TRA"), hereby orders the following:

1. For the purpose of this Protective Order (the "Order"), proprietary or confidential information, hereinafter referred to as "CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION" shall mean documents and information in whatever form which the producing party, in good faith, deems to contain or constitute trade secrets, confidential commercial information, confidential research or development information, confidential financial statements, confidential data of third parties, or other commercially sensitive information, and which has been specifically designated by the producing party. A "Producing Party" is defined as the party creating the confidential information as well as the party having

actual physical possession of information produced pursuant to this Order. All summaries, notes, extracts, compilations or other direct or indirect reproduction from or of any protected materials, shall be entitled to protection under this Order. Documents containing CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION shall be specifically marked as confidential on the cover. Any document so designated shall be handled in accordance with this Order. The provisions of any document containing CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION may be challenged under Paragraph 11 of this Order.

- 2. Any individual or company subject to this Order, including producing parties or persons reviewing CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION, shall act in good faith in discharging their obligations hereunder. Parties or nonparties subject to this Order shall include parties who are allowed by the TRA to intervene subsequent to the date of entry of this Protective Order.
- 3. Unless specifically otherwise ordered by the TRA, CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION shall be used only for the purposes of this proceeding, and shall be expressly limited and disclosed only to the following persons:
 - (a) Counsel of record for the parties and other legal counsel for the parties in this case and associates, secretaries and paralegals actively engaged in assisting counsel of record in this proceeding;
 - (b) TRA Directors and members of the staff of the TRA;
 - (c) Representatives or employees of the parties who need to know because they are actively engaged in assisting counsel of record in preparing for this proceeding or who need to know to assist in decision making purposes for the disposition of this proceeding;
 - (d) Any employee of the Office of the Attorney General and Reporter for the State of Tennessee; and
 - (e) Outside consultants and expert witnesses employed or retained by the parties or their counsel, who need access to CONFIDENTIAL

INFORMATION solely for evaluation, testing, testimony, preparation for trial or other services related to this docket, provided that to the extent that any party seeks to disclose CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION to any outside consultant or expert witness who is expected to testify on that party's behalf, the party shall give five (5) days written notice to the Producing Party of intention to disclose CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION. During such notice period, the Producing Party may move to prevent or limit disclosure for cause, in which case no disclosure shall be made until the TRA, the Hearing Officer, the Administrative Law Judge or court rules on the motion. Any such motion shall be filed within three (3) days after service of the notice. Any response shall be filed within three (3) days after service of the Motion. A Pre-hearing conference may be called to confer with the parties on the Motions to Limit Disclosure. All service shall be by hand delivery or by facsimile.

Under no circumstances shall any CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION be disclosed to or discussed with anyone associated with the marketing of products, goods or services that may be in competition with the products, goods or services of the Producing Party or the Producing Party's customers. Counsel for the parties are expressly prohibited from disclosing CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION produced by another party to their respective clients, except for in-house counsel and persons who need to know in order to assist counsel of record with preparation of the case.

4. Prior to disclosure of CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION to any employee or associate counsel for a party, TRA Director, or TRA staff member, the counsel representing the party who is to receive the CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION shall provide a copy of this Order to the recipient employee, associate counsel, TRA Director or staff member, who shall be bound by the terms of this Order. Prior to disclosure of CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION to any outside consultant or expert witness employed or retained by a party, counsel shall provide a copy of this Order to such outside consultant or expert witness, who shall sign an Affidavit in the form of that

attached to this Order attesting that he or she has read a copy of this Order, that he or she understands and agrees to be bound by the terms of this Order, and that he or she understands that unauthorized disclosure of the documents labeled "CONFIDENTIAL" constitutes a violation of this Order. This Affidavit shall be signed in the presence of and be notarized by a notary public. Counsel of record for each party shall provide the Producing Party a copy of each such Affidavit and shall keep the Affidavits executed by the parties' experts or consultants on file in their respective offices.

- 5. If any party or non-party subject to this Order inadvertently fails to designate documents as CONFIDENTIAL in accordance with the provisions of this Order when producing the documents this failure shall not constitute a waiver of confidentiality, provided the party or non-party who has produced the document shall notify the recipient of the document in writing within five (5) days of discovery of such inadvertent failure to designate the document as CONFIDENTIAL. At that time, the recipients will immediately treat the subject document as CONFIDENTIAL. In no event shall the TRA, or any other Party to this Order, be liable for any claims or damages resulting from the disclosure of a document provided while not so labeled as "CONFIDENTIAL". An inadvertent failure to designate a document as CONFIDENTIAL, shall not, in any way, affect the TRA's determination as to whether the document is entitled to CONFIDENTIAL status.
- 6. If any party or non-party subject to this Order inadvertently fails to designate documents as CONFIDENTIAL in accordance with the provisions of this Order when producing such documents and the failure is not discovered in time to provide a five (5) day notification to the recipient of the confidential nature of the

documents referenced in the paragraph above, the failure shall not constitute a waiver of confidentiality and a party by written motion or by oral motion at a Pre-Hearing Conference or at the Hearing on the merits may request designation of the documents as CONFDENTIAL, and if the motion is granted by the Hearing Officer, Administrative Law Judge or the Authority, the recipients shall immediately treat the subject documents as CONFIDENTIAL. The Tennessee Regulatory Authority, the Hearing Officer or Administrative Law Judge may also, at his or her discretion, either before or during the Pre-Hearing Conference or Hearing on the Merits of the case, allow information to be designated CONFIDENTIAL and treated as such in accordance with the terms of this Order.

7. Any papers filed in this proceeding that contain, quote, paraphrase, compile or otherwise disclose documents covered by the terms of this Order, or any information contained therein, shall be filed and maintained in the TRA Docket Room in sealed envelopes marked CONFIDENTIAL and labeled to reflect the style of this proceeding, the docket number, the contents of the envelope sufficient to identify its subject matter and this Order. The envelopes shall be maintained in a locked filing cabinet. The envelopes shall not be opened or their contents reviewed by anyone except upon order of the TRA, Hearing Officer, or Administrative Law Judge after due notice to counsel of record. Notwithstanding the foregoing, the Directors and the Staff of the TRA may review any paper filed as CONFIDENTIAL without obtaining an order of the TRA, Hearing Officer or Administrative Law Judge, provided the Directors and Staff maintain the confidentiality of the paper in accordance with the terms of this Order.

- 8. Documents, information and testimony designated as CONFIDENTIAL or PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS (as defined in Paragraph 19) in accordance with this Order, may be used in testimony at the Hearing of this proceeding and offered into evidence used in any hearing related to this action in a manner that protects the confidentiality of the information, subject to the Tennessee Rules of Evidence and to such future orders as the TRA, the Hearing Officer, or the Administrative Law Judge may enter. Any party intending to use documents, information, or testimony designated CONFIDENTIAL or PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS shall inform the Producing Party and the TRA, the Hearing Officer, or the Administrative Law Judge, prior to the Hearing on the Merits of the case, of the proposed use; and shall advise the TRA, the Hearing Officer, or the Administrative Law Judge, and the Producing Party before use of the information during witness examinations so that appropriate measures can be taken by the TRA, the Hearing Officer, or the Administrative Law Judge to protect the confidential nature of the information.
- 9. Except for documents filed in the TRA Docket Room, all documents covered by the terms of this Order that are disclosed to the requesting party shall be maintained separately in files marked CONFIDENTIAL and labeled with reference to this Order at the offices of the requesting party's counsel of record, kept in a secure place and returned to the Producing Party pursuant to Paragraph 16 of this Order.
- 10. Nothing herein shall be construed as preventing any party from continuing to use and disclose any information (a) that is in the public domain, or (b) that subsequently becomes part of the public domain through no act of the party, or (c) that is disclosed to it by a third party, where said disclosure does not itself violate any

contractual or legal obligation, or (d) that is independently developed by a party, or (e) that is known or used by it prior to this proceeding. The burden of establishing the existence of (a) through (e) shall be upon the party attempting to use or disclose the information.

11. Any party may contest the designation of any document or information as CONFIDENTIAL or PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS by filing a motion with the TRA, Hearing Officer, Administrative Law Judge or the courts, as appropriate, for a ruling that the documents, information or testimony should not be so treated. Prior to filing the motion, the party contesting the designation will offer to meet and confer with the Producing Party in a good faith effort to discuss both parties' positions and attempt to resolve the dispute. The Producing Party will respond within seven (7) days of the filing of the motion unless otherwise provided by the TRA, Hearing Officer, Administrative Law Judge, or the courts, and will set forth the basis and justification for the CONFIDENTIAL designation pursuant to this Order. The Producing Party shall have the burden of establishing the need for designating the challenged documents, information, or testimony as either CONFIDENTIAL or PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS. All documents, information and testimony designated as CONFIDENTIAL or PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS, however, shall be maintained as such until the TRA, the Hearing Officer, the Administrative Law Judge or a court orders otherwise. A motion to contest must be filed in accordance with the procedural schedule, or if one does not exist, not later than five (5) days after receipt of the materials designated CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION or fifteen (15) days prior to the Hearing on the merits whichever date Any timely motions made and subsequent replies received within the five occurs later.

- (5) days prior to the Hearing on the merits should be presented to the TRA at the Hearing on the merits unless otherwise ordered by the TRA or the Hearing Officer.
- 12. Nothing in this Order shall prevent any party from asserting any objection to discovery other than an objection based upon grounds of confidentiality.
- 13. Non-party witnesses shall be entitled to invoke the provisions of this Order by designating information disclosed or documents produced for use in this action as CONFIDENTIAL, in which event the provisions of this Order shall govern the disclosure of information or documents provided by the non-party witness. A non-party witness' designation of information as CONFIDENTIAL may be challenged under Paragraph 11 of this Order.
- 14. No person authorized under the terms herein to receive access to documents, information, or testimony designated as CONFIDENTIAL shall be granted access until such person has complied with the requirements set forth in Paragraph 4 of this Order.
- 15. Any person to whom disclosure or inspection is made in violation of this Order shall be bound by the terms of this Order.
- 16. Upon an order becoming final in this proceeding or any appeals resulting from such an order, all the filings, exhibits and other materials and information designated CONFIDENTIAL or PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS and all copies thereof shall be returned to counsel for the party who produced (or originally created) the filings, exhibits and other materials, within fifteen (15) days. The Consumer Advocate, if it determines that it has good cause to retain any CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION, may file a motion with the TRA requesting permission to retain the CONFIDENTIAL

INFORMATION. The Consumer Advocate will give the Producing Party prior notice of its intention to seek said permission from the TRA and will provide copies of any such motion to the Producing Party so that the Producing Party may have the opportunity to oppose the Consumer Advocate's motion. Should the TRA grant the Consumer Advocate permission to retain copies of CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION, the Consumer Advocate must continue to comply with, and to maintain the CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION in accordance with, the terms and conditions of this Protective Order. Subject to the requirements of Paragraph 7 above, the TRA may retain copies of information designated as CONFIDENTIAL or PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS as may be necessary to maintain the record of this case intact. Counsel who received the filings, exhibits and other materials, designated as CONFIDENTIAL or PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS shall certify to counsel for the Producing Party that all the filings, exhibits and other materials, plus all copies or extracts, notes or memorandums from the filings, exhibits and other materials, and all copies of the extracts from the filings, exhibits and other materials thereof have been delivered to counsel for the Producing Party or destroyed and that any electronic copies of CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION or PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS received or mentioned by the receiving party have been eliminated.

17. After termination of this proceeding, the provisions of this Order relating to the confidential nature of CONFIDENTIAL DOCUMENTS or PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS, information and testimony shall continue to be binding upon parties herein and their officers, employers, employees, agents, and/or others unless this Order is vacated or modified.

- 18. Nothing herein shall prevent entry of a subsequent order, upon an appropriate showing, requiring that any documents, information or testimony designated as CONFIDENTIAL shall receive protection other than that provided herein.
- 19. In addition to the other provisions of this Order, Chattanooga Gas Company ("the Company") may designate and label as "PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS" documents and information related to security measures undertaken to protect public health and safety. The Company shall provide access to PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS to TRA Directors and members of the staff of the TRA and further only to authorized representatives of Complainant/Petitioner, or the Intervenors in this docket. Authorized representatives shall be limited to the following: in the event that TRA staff becomes a party, one counsel of record and one other staff member or person under contract to the staff, each authorized in writing by a senior official of the TRA to have such access; and with respect to any other party, two counsel of record and a single other person, employed by or under contract to the party, authorized by that party in a written certification mutually agreeable to the parties.
- 20. The Company shall provide access to an authorized representative to PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS only after such authorized representative has executed an Affidavit in the form of that attached to this Order and provided a copy to the Company. Except with consent of the Company: (i) access shall be at the offices of the Company or its counsel of record and under supervision of the Company; (ii) PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS shall not be removed from the offices of the Company or its counsel; (iii) no copies shall be provided to an authorized representative except as provided herein. Authorized representatives may make notes or memoranda

from a review of the PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS and may remove such notes and memoranda. In all other respects such notes and memoranda shall remain PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS and subject to the provisions hereof. PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS shall be used only to assist TRA staff or any other party to prepare for and to try this proceeding and shall not be used for any other purpose in this or any other jurisdiction.

21. Except as provided in this Order, the contents of PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS to which the TRA staff or other party is given access, and any notes, memoranda, or any form or information or opinions regarding or derived from the PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS shall not be disclosed to anyone other than an authorized representative in accordance with the Order, except that an authorized representative may disclose his or her conclusions or findings solely within, and for the purposes of, this proceeding and in accordance with this Order. PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS shall not otherwise be published, disclosed or divulged except as expressly provided herein. The TRA Directors, TRA staff and any other party shall treat all notes memoranda or opinions regarding or derived from the PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS as highly confidential and shall keep them in a secure location with access limited to an authorized representative, and the contents of PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS and any information derived from them shall be considered highly confidential, and shall not be deemed public records. The TRA staff, any party, Hearing Officer, or the TRA Directors may discuss any position or conclusion regarding security expenditures and testimony in briefs, orders, pleadings, or hearings in this

proceeding without disclosing protected information to the public in accordance with this Order.

- 22. The Attorney General and his staff have authority to enter into Nondisclosure Agreements pursuant to Tenn. Code Ann. § 65-4-118 which are consistent with state and federal law, regulations and rules.
- 23. The Attorney General and his staff agree to keep CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION in a secure place and will not permit them to be seen by any person who is not an employee of the Office of Attorney General and Reporter for the State of Tennessee, or a person who has not signed a Nondisclosure Agreement.
- 24. The Attorney General and his staff may make copies of CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION or any portion thereof. To the extent permitted by state and federal law, regulations and rules, all notes utilizing supporting CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION shall be subject to the terms of this Order to the extent factual assertions are derived from the supporting information.
- 25. To the extent permitted by state law, the Attorney General will provide timely notice of filing or disclosure in the discharge of the duties of the Office of the Attorney General and Reporter, pursuant to Tenn. Code Ann. § 10-7-504(a)(5)(C) or any other law, regulation or rule, so that the Company may take action relating to disclosure.
- 26. The obligations of the Attorney General and his staff under this Order are further subject to the state's Public Records Act and other open records statutes. Nothing in this Order is intended to violate or alter the state's Public Records Act or Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA"). In the event that the Attorney General or member of his staff is served with a subpoena, public records request, FOIA request, or other request that

calls for the production of confidential commercial information labeled as "CONFIDENTIAL" by the Company, the Attorney General will notify the Company by notifying the undersigned of the existence of the subpoena, public records request, FOIA request, or other request, at least five (5) business days before responding to the request to the extent permitted by state law and orders of the court as long as the Attorney General or his staff is able to respond to the request within a reasonable time. Following the five (5) day notice period, the Attorney General or his staff may elect to wait to produce such information as allowed by state law in order to provide the Company an opportunity to challenge said subpoena or request or to make arrangements to preserve the confidentiality of the confidential commercial information labeled as "CONFIDENTIAL" by the Company that is subject to such request.

27. The designation of any information, documents or things in accordance with this Order as constituting or containing CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION and the Attorney General's or his staff's treatment of such material as confidential or proprietary in compliance with this Order is not an admission or agreement by the Attorney General or his staff that the material constitutes or contains CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION and shall not be deemed to be either a waiver of the state's right to challenge such designation or an acceptance of such designation. The Company agrees to designate information, documents or things provided to the Attorney General as CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION if it has a good faith basis for the claim. The Company will upon request of the Attorney General or his staff provide a written explanation of the details that support its CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION claim within five (5) business days of a written request. The Company also specifically agrees that it will not designate any

documents as CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION or label such documents as "CONFIDENTIAL" if the documents:

- (a) have been distributed to the public or consumers, provided that proprietary customer information provided by the Company to its customers or their marketers may be designated as CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION; or
- (b) are not maintained by the Company as confidential commercial information or trade secrets or are not maintained by the Company as proprietary customer information.
- 28. Nothing in this Order shall prevent the Attorney General from using the CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION received for investigative purposes in the discharge of the duties of the Office of the Attorney General and Reporter. Additionally, nothing in this Order shall prevent the Attorney General from informing state officials and third parties of the fact of an investigation, as needed, to conduct the investigation. Without limiting the scope of this paragraph, nothing in this Order shall prevent the Attorney General from contacting consumers whose names were provided by the Company or from discussing with any consumer any materials that he or she allegedly received from the Company or confirming that a consumer actually received the materials, to the extent that the Attorney General or his staff does so in a manner that complies with the provisions of this Order.
- 29. The terms of the foregoing paragraphs 22 through 28 do not apply to PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS as set forth in paragraphs 19-21 of this Order.

PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS shall be treated in accordance with paragraphs 19-21.

- 30. All information, documents and things designated as CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION or PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS and produced in accordance with this Order may be disclosed in testimony or offered into evidence at any TRA or court hearing, trial, motion or proceeding of this matter, subject to the provisions of this Order and the applicable Rules of Evidence. The party who produced the information, documents and things designated as CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION or PROTECTED SECURITY MATERIALS agrees to stipulate to the authentication of such information, documents and things in any such proceeding.
- 31. Nothing in this Order is intended to restrict or alter federal or state laws, regulations or rules.
- 32. Any person who has signed a Nondisclosure Statement or is otherwise bound by the terms of this Order shall continue to be bound by this Order and/or Nondisclosure Statement even if no longer engaged by the TRA or Intervenors.

Hearing Officer

APPROVED FOR ENTRY:

By: J.W./Juna, Esq. (BPR #5780)

Jennifer L. Brundige, Esq. (BPR # 20673)

LUNA LAW GROUP, PLLC

333 Union Street, Suite 300

Nashville, TN 37201

(615) 254-9146

Attorneys for Chattanooga Gas Company

By: J. E. Midyett of summer by JB T. E. Midyett, Esq. (BPR #003961)

Southern Advocacy

318 Erin Drive, Suite 2A

Knoxville, TN 37919

(865) 766-0106

Attorney for ConocoPhillips

By: Ryan McGehee, Esq. (BPR #025559)

Consumer Advocate and Protection Division

Office of Attorney General

P.O. Box 20207

Nashville, TN 37202-0207

(615) 741-8723

Attorney for the Consumer Advocate and Protection Division

BEFORE THE TENNESSEE REGULATORY AUTHORITY NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE

IN RE:)
COMPLAINT OF CONOCOPHILLIPS COMPANY FOR AN ORDER DETERMINING CONOCOPHILLIPS NOT LIABLE FOR PENALTIE AND CHARGES ASSESSED BY CHATTANOOGA GAS COMPANY, OR, IN THE ALTERNATIVE, PETITION FOR SPECIAL RELIEF)) Docket No. 11-00210 (CS))))
AGREEMENT TO COMPLY WITH PROT	ECTIVE ORDER
I have reviewed the Protective Order entered in agree to abide and be bound by its terms. I understand documents labeled "CONFIDENTIAL" or "PROTECTE will be a violation of the Order.	that unauthorized disclosure of
DATE NAM	IE
STATE OF)	
COUNTY OF)	
Personally appeared before me,, with whom I am personally acqu executed the within instrument for the purposes therein co	ired, who acknowledged that he
WITNESS my hand, at office, thisday of _	, 2012.
	NOTARY PUBLIC
	My Commission Expires:

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this $\frac{12^{94}}{3}$ day of March 2012 a true and correct copy of the foregoing was served on the persons below by electronic mail:

Kelly Cashman Grams Hearing Officer Tennessee Regulatory Authority 460 James Robertson Parkway Nashville, Tennessee 37243-00505

Ryan McGehee Consumer Advocate and Protection Division Office of Attorney General 2nd Floor 425 5th Avenue North Nashville, TN 37202

T. E. Midyett Attorney at Law 318 Erin Drive, Suite 2A Knoxville, TN 37919

Jerry L Sundy.