

David Killion

PHONE: (615) 742-7718
FAX: (615) 742-0414
E-MAIL: dkillion@bassberry.com

150 Third Avenue South, Suite 2800 Nashville, TN 37201 (615) 742-6200

February 28, 2011

## VIA EMAIL

FILED ELECTRONICALLY IN DOCKET OFFICE ON 02/28/11

Chairman Mary W. Freeman c/o Sharla Dillon Tennessee Regulatory Authority 460 James Robertson Parkway Nashville, Tennessee 37243

Re:

Docket No. 10-00189: Petition Of Tennessee American Water Company To Change And Increase Certain Rates And Charges So As To Permit It To Earn A Fair And Adequate Rate Of Return On Its Property Used And Useful In Furnishing Water Service To Its Customers

Dear Chairman Freeman:

Enclosed please find Tennessee American Water Company's Petition for Appeal of the Hearing Officer's Initial Order Granting the City of Chattanooga's First Motion in Limine.

Due to all parties having relocated to Chattanooga for the Hearing on the Merits this week, an original and four copies will be filed with the TRA Dockets and Records Manager, Sharla Dillon, on March 7<sup>th</sup>.

Should you have any questions concerning this matter, please do not hesitate to contact me at the email address or telephone number listed above.

Sincerely

David Killion

Enclosure

CC:

Mr. Richard Collier, Esq. (w/enclosure) Ryan McGehee, Esq. (w/ enclosure) Mary L. White, Esq. (w/ enclosure) David C. Higney, Esq. (w/ enclosure) Chairman Mary Freeman February 28, 2011 Page 2

Henry M. Walker, Esq. (w/ enclosure)
Michael A. McMahan, Esq. (w/ enclosure)
Valerie L. Malueg, Esq. (w/ enclosure)
Frederick L. Hitchcock, Esq. (w/ enclosure)
Harold L. North, Jr., Esq. (w/ enclosure)
Mark Brooks, Esq. (w/ enclosure)
Scott H. Strauss, Esq. (w/ enclosure)
Katharine M. Mapes, Esq. (w/ enclosure)
Donald L. Scholes, Esq. (w/ enclosure)

9324667.1

## BEFORE THE TENNESSEE REGULATORY AUTHORITY NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE

IN RE:	}
PETITION OF TENNESSEE AMERICAN WATER COMPANY TO CHANGE AND INCREASE CERTAIN RATES AND CHARGES SO AS TO PERMIT IT TO EARN A FAIR AND ADEQUATE RATE OF RETURN ON ITS PROPERTY USED AND USEFUL IN FURNISHING WATER SERVICE TO ITS CUSTOMERS	Docket No. 10-00189

## PETITION FOR APPEAL OF THE HEARING OFFICER'S INITIAL ORDER GRANTING THE CITY OF CHATTANOOGA'S FIRST MOTION IN LIMINE

Pursuant to Tenn. Code Ann. § 4-5-415(b), Tennessee American Water Company ("TAWC") respectfully petitions for an appeal of the Initial Order of the Hearing Officer in the above-captioned docket granting the City of Chattanooga's First Motion in Limine. TAWC appeals the Hearing Officer's ruling issued February 25, 2011 excluding all evidence pertaining to consideration of the \$275,000 in regulatory expenses excluded from recovery in Docket No. 08-00039.

The procedural schedule in this matter required that all pre-hearing motions were to be filed by February 14, 2011. Nevertheless, the City of Chattanooga proceeded to file its First Motion in Limine on February 24, 2011 – one day before the Pre-Hearing Conference. At the Pre-Hearing Conference the Hearing Officer granted the City's motion prior to TAWC responding to the motion or presenting argument. Upon request, counsel for TAWC was allowed to state the basis for the Company's opposition on the record. The Hearing Officer then issued an Order containing the ruling the evening of February 25, 2011.

On January 28, 2011, in the appeal of Docket No. 08-00039, the Court of Appeals held "the TRA's decision to only include one half of the cost of the rate case in the rate was arbitrary. Accordingly, we reverse the Commission of the TRA on this issue and award TAWC the full amount of its proposed rate case expenses." Tennessee American Water Company v. Tennessee Regulatory Authority, Case No. M2009-00553-COA-R12-CV, at 30 (Jan. 28, 2011). The City claims in its motion that because the Authority has not yet received the mandate from the Court of Appeals, the regulatory expenses improperly excluded from rates in Docket No. 08-00039 should not be considered in this rate case.

The City's motion ignores the reality of the rate-making process. Regardless of whether the Authority currently has jurisdiction to act in Docket No. 08-00039, TAWC has not asked the Authority to award those expenses in that docket; rather, TAWC has only asked the Authority to consider awarding the full amount of TAWC's 2008 regulatory expenses in this docket. The TRA has the ability to consider any evidence in setting just and reasonable rates in the current docket. Moreover, by the time the Authority does receive the mandate from the Court of Appeals, Docket No. 08-00039 will likely be moot due to new superseding tariffs having already become effective in the current docket.

Choosing not to include in the rates in this case the amount now known that the Court of Appeals has ordered the Authority to award will only increase the costs to TAWC – and its customers – for recovery of those fees in some future rate case or other proceeding. Principles of fairness and economy therefore mandate that the Authority consider TAWC's improperly excluded 2008 regulatory expenses in the current case rather than requiring the Company to file yet another rate case or other proceeding to recover these expenses.

Moreover, in the event an appeal in Docket No. 08-00039 is taken to the Tennessee Supreme Court and it reverses the Court of Appeals, the amount resulting from that change can simply be subject to a true-up in a later rate case.

Respectfully submitted,

R. Dale Grimes (#006223)

E. Steele Clayton (#017298)

C. David Killion (#026412)

BASS, BERRY & SIMS PLC

150 Third Avenue South, Suite 2800

Nashville, TN 37201

(615) 742-6200

Attorneys for Petitioner Tennessee American Water Company

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been served by way of the method(s) indicated on this the 28<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2011, upon the following:

<ul><li>[x] Hand-Delivery</li><li>[ ] U.S. Mail</li><li>[ ] Facsimile</li><li>[ ] Overnight</li><li>[x] Email</li></ul>	Ryan McGehee, Esq. Mary L. White, Esq. Counsel for the Consumer Advocate and Protection Division Office of the Attorney General 425 5th Avenue North, 2nd Floor Nashville, TN 37243-0491
<ul><li>[x] Hand-Delivery</li><li>[] U.S. Mail</li><li>[] Facsimile</li><li>[] Overnight</li><li>[x] Email</li></ul>	David C. Higney, Esq. Counsel for Chattanooga Regional Manufacturers Association Grant, Konvalinka & Harrison, P.C. 633 Chestnut Street, 9th Floor Chattanooga, TN 37450
<ul><li>[x] Hand-Delivery</li><li>[] U.S. Mail</li><li>[] Facsimile</li><li>[] Overnight</li><li>[x] Email</li></ul>	Henry M. Walker, Esq. Counsel for Chattanooga Regional Manufacturers Association Bradley, Arant, Boult, Cummings, PLC 1600 Division Street, Suite 700 Nashville, TN 37203
<ul><li>[x] Hand-Delivery</li><li>[ ] U.S. Mail</li><li>[ ] Facsimile</li><li>[ ] Overnight</li><li>[x] Email</li></ul>	Michael A. McMahan, Esq. Valerie L. Malueg, Esq. City of Chattanooga (Hamilton County) Office of the City Attorney 100 East 11th Street, Suite 200 Chattanooga, TN 37402
<ul><li>[x] Hand-Delivery</li><li>[ ] U.S. Mail</li><li>[ ] Facsimile</li><li>[ ] Overnight</li><li>[x] Email</li></ul>	Frederick L. Hitchcock, Esq. Harold L. North, Jr., Esq. Counsel for City of Chattanooga Chambliss, Bahner & Stophel, P.C. 1000 Tallan Building Two Union Square Chattanooga, TN 37402

[x] Hand-Delivery	Mark Brooks, Esq.
U.S. Mail	Counsel for Utility Workers Union of America,
[ ] Facsimile	AFL-CIO and UWUA Local 121
Overnight	521 Central Avenue
[x] Email	Nashville, TN 37211
[x] Hand-Delivery	Scott H. Strauss, Esq.
[ ] U.S. Mail	Katharine M. Mapes, Esq.
[ ] Facsimile	Counsel for UWUA, AFL-CIO and UWUA Local 121
Overnight	Spiegel & McDiarmid LLP
[x] Email	1333 New Hampshire Avenue, NW
	Washington, DC 20036
[x] Hand-Delivery	Donald L. Scholes, Esq.
[ ] U.S. Mail	Counsel for Walden's Ridge Utility District and Signal Mountain
[ ] Facsimile	Branstetter, Stranch & Jennings PLLC
Overnight	227 Second Avenue North
[x] Email	Fourth Floor
	Nashville, TN 37201

9324597.1