## Office of the Attorney General



REG'D IN REGULATORY AUTH.

\*02 MAY 16 AM 10 02

PAUL G. SUMMERS ATTORNEY GENERAL AND REPORTER

OFFICE OF THE EXECUTIVE SECRETAR

MICHAEL E. MOORE SOLICITOR GENERAL

LUCY HONEY HAYNES ASSOCIATE CHIEF DEPUTY ATTORNEY GENERAL

ANDY D. BENNETT CHIEF DEPUTY ATTORNEY GENERAL

Reply to: **Consumer Advocate and Protection Division Attorney General's Office** P.O. Box 20207 Nashville, TN 37202

425 FIFTH AVENUE NORTH NASHVILLE, TN 37243-0485

TELEPHONE (615) 741-3491 FACSIMILE (615) 741-2009

May 16, 2002

Mr. David Waddell **Executive Secretary** Tennessee Regulatory Authority 460 James Robertson Parkway Nashville, TN 37243-0505

Re:

Audit of United Cities Gas Company's Incentive Plan Account (IPA) for the

Period of April 1, 2000 through March 31, 2001

Docket No. 01-00704

Dear Mr. Waddell:

Enclosed is an original and thirteen copies of the Consumer Advocate and Protection Division's response to United Cities Gas Company's Motion to Disqualify Witness in the abovereferenced matter. Copies are being furnished to counsel of record for interested parties.

Sincerely,

MOTHY C. PHILLIPS Assistant Attorney General

cc: Counsel of Record

## IN THE TENNESSEE REGULATORY AUTHORITY NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE

IN RE: AUDIT OF UNITED CITIES GAS COMPANY'S INCENTIVE PLAN	)	DOCKET NO. 01-00704
ACCOUNT (IPA) FOR THE PERIOD OF APRIL 1, 2000 THROUGH MARCH 31,	)	
2001	)	

## THE CONSUMER ADVOCATE AND PROTECTION DIVISION'S RESPONSE TO UNITED CITIES GAS COMPANY'S MOTION TO DISQUALIFY WITNESS

The Authority, as a precautionary measure, has directed Mr. Dan McCormac to not advise it on matters pertaining to this proceeding.<sup>1</sup> Contrary to United Cities Gas Company's (UCG) refrain, this militates in favor of Mr. McCormac being allowed to testify. Because UCG has made no showing to overcome the presumption that Mr. McCormac is a competent witness,<sup>2</sup> UCG's motion should be summarily rejected.

UCG's assertion that Mr. McCormac's prior employment by the Consumer Advocate and Protection Division and that his entirely appropriate previous testimony operate to disqualify him as a witness because UCG apparently does not like that testimony is meritless. UCG's generalized assertion that the Directors would taint the integrity of the process and violate the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Contrary to the tenor of UCG's motion, the Consumer Advocate and Protection Division is not aware of any ruling by the Authority <u>excluding</u> Mr. McCormac from performing advisory functions or any finding by the Authority that Mr. McCormac has conducted himself improperly in any respect.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>See, e.g., Rule 601, Tennessee Rules of Evidence; State v. Caruthers, 35 S.W. 3d 516 (S.Ct. 2000).

Code of Ethical Conduct of the Directors by allowing Mr. McCormac to testify is patently insubstantial and unsupported by any authority.

UCG has not asserted anything specific that would come close to meeting its burden to overcome the presumption of competence or that would remotely warrant disqualifying Mr. McCormac as a witness. UCG's motion to disqualify Mr. McCormac as a witness, therefore, should be summarily denied.

Respectfully submitted,

RUSSELL T. PERKINS, B.P.R. #10282

Deputy Attorney General

TIMOTHY C. PHILLIPS, B.P.R. #12751

Assistant Attorney General

SHILINA B. CHATTERJEE, B.P.R. #20689

Assistant Attorney General

Office of the Attorney General

Consumer Advocate and Protection Division

P.O. Box 20207

Nashville, Tennessee 37202

(615) 532-3382

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing was served via facsimile and U.S. Mail on May \_/ 6\_, 2002.

Richard Collier, Esq. General Counsel Tennessee Regulatory Authority 460 James Robertson Parkway Nashville, Tennessee 37243-0505 Facsimile (615) 741-5015

Jonathon Wike, Esq. General Counsel Tennessee Regulatory Authority 460 James Robertson Parkway Nashville, Tennessee 37243-0505 Facsimile (615) 741-5015

Joe A. Conner, Esq. Baker, Donelson, Bearman & Caldwell 1800 Republic Centre 633 Chestnut Street Chattanooga, Tennessee 37450-1800 Facsimile (423) 752-4410

> Shiliha B. Chatterjee Assistant Attorney General

55071